| **Student Name:** Stephanie Kwan |
| --- |

| **Motion**: In post-colonial states, This house believes that education (e.g. history curricula) should graphically and exclusively focus on the negative impact of colonialism. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 70 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Our opening needs to be clear - this is not just about the full extent of colonialism, this is about obscuring any positives/neutrality to the greatest extent. We shouldn’t be acknowledging that colonialism is good - this is not a clash in the debate; neither if colonialism was good or bad; it’s about why education should be so fixated on this side.  Our opening took us two minutes to get through - and we didn’t use any examples of what this might look like - what does such a **negative depiction** look like?  Set-up   * Good use of examples, good use of subjects. * Is the outcome exclusively empathy? Why is the only way we can teach empathy through this mechanism? * Good on why it has to be young people. We say lots about what young people should or shouldn’t be like as just statements here and there; what is the purpose of this?   POI: Are they unable to see nuanced world-views? We say young people are underdeveloped - they cannot understand nuance - and hence they rewrite history and think colonialism was good. These are JUMPS we are making. Why does it happen in this way? This is the first point in the speech that you look at the exclusivity of your side. This is at 4 minutes.  Argument 1 (started at 4:25..)   * Is it true that this happens? Is it true that we don’t focus on slavery enough, or that people believe this about colonialism? * Why are you suddenly arguing that slavery had positive economic growth? * This mechanism is a lot for the exclusive outcome of empathy and understanding their history. What is this negative impact? What specific impacts are you talking about?   Argument 2 (at 6:37)   * Why is the mech here too about young people and their development? Are kids the only ones studying history or engaging with it? * Did we mechanise this argument?   We needed to argue the following:   * Colonial history often marginalised or erased the narratives of the colonised. A graphic focus on the negative impacts—exploitation, oppression, cultural destruction—serves to rectify this injustice by bringing these experiences to the forefront. This can be a powerful tool for fostering a sense of shared identity and collective memory among the formerly colonised. * What is needed by the population moving forward? How do we create a central national identity? Why is this important? Was there a lot of fragmentation and alienation between ethnic communities during colonisation? Consider what the needs of a post-colonial country are!   07:19 | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Ryan Qian |
| --- |

| **Motion**: In post-colonial states, This house believes that education (e.g. history curricula) should graphically and exclusively focus on the negative impact of colonialism. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 70 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Good identification; point out or call out the singular mech of young people lacking fully developed brains. Is it true that they are unable to look at anything nuanced and form reasonable opinions?  Don’t make this about colonialism apologism - this isn’t the debate. It shouldn’t be the debate. The debate should be about the element of education and this kind of teaching; and what impact this has on nation building and state building.  Set-up   * Fair on objective - why is this important? What burden are we connecting this model to?   Rebuttal   * Call out this kind of status quo characterisation; is it true that there is a glorification? We call it out, but need to explain why this means there is no NEED for Prop to do this.   Argument 1   * Graphic doesn’t really mean visual - it just means in explicit detail. The Prop team doesn’t have to defend traumatising children! * Why is it bad for this dichotomy to be established? Practically, how does it impact them? * What is the impact of this argument?   Argument 2   * Why do they have to be objective? We assert that they do, but don’t explain why. * Why must education be objective? What is the impact here? * What do we mean by segregation and racism? This is a vague description of an outcome, no unpacking at all!   On Opp, this is a debate about anger and identity, and the concept of colonial determinism. Colonial determinism attributes current problems solely to historical colonialism, and in the process, it risks absolving post-colonial governments and elites of responsibility for their own actions and policies. It can create a narrative where current struggles are solely the fault of external forces, hindering efforts to address internal issues like corruption, mismanagement, and social inequalities. This can also discourage local initiatives and solutions by fostering a sense of helplessness.  07:18 | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Audrey Lai |
| --- |

| **Motion**: In post-colonial states, This house believes that education (e.g. history curricula) should graphically and exclusively focus on the negative impact of colonialism. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 71 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Is this a debate about whether or not colonialism is good or bad? Should it be? This is about the impact education that focuses on exceptionally negative depictions has; we need to point out that people either (a) do not know how bad colonialism was (b) that no benefits even exist (not an option to you because of your stance at first); you try to make up for this by talking about the costs, but this should have been the big push from the start.  Good work trying to recharacterise the kind of status quo which exists; but we do this in a pretty unstructured fashion; after your opening, you need to make sure your responses have some clear strategic path forward.  POI: Is it prejudice if it is true? Are we teaching them the descendants of colonisers are to blame, or just the colonisers..? You also can’t argue on the basis of nuance because at first your team argued that young people are incapable of conceptualising nuance.  Argument 1   * What is this healing or progress that is needed? We need to explain or unpack what the moral value or practical value of this is? * On historical amnesia - good, but is this because of colonialism or globalisation…? * Good example of South Africa - but what is the implication of this? Aside from recognition or reconnection, what is the outcome? Why is recognition or reconnection impossible under a nuanced interpretation of colonialism? Were only the colonisers to be blamed for these in-group and out-group dynamics? * We need to explain how the erasure of indigenous languages, or artifacts, or identities meant that these countries could not develop or grow or flourish and so forth. * POI - clear response.   We needed to argue the following:   * Colonial history often marginalised or erased the narratives of the colonised. A graphic focus on the negative impacts—exploitation, oppression, cultural destruction—serves to rectify this injustice by bringing these experiences to the forefront. This can be a powerful tool for fostering a sense of shared identity and collective memory among the formerly colonised. * What is needed by the population moving forward? How do we create a central national identity? Why is this important? Was there a lot of fragmentation and alienation between ethnic communities during colonisation? Consider what the needs of a post-colonial country are!   07:07 | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Hanson Ko |
| --- |

| **Motion**: In post-colonial states, This house believes that education (e.g. history curricula) should graphically and exclusively focus on the negative impact of colonialism. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 70.5 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Good opening, good challenge - lack of justification of why it has to be so singularly focused.  Don’t make this about colonialism apologism - this isn’t the debate. It shouldn’t be the debate. The debate should be about the element of education and this kind of teaching; and what impact this has on nation building and state building.  On Opp, this is a debate about anger and identity, and the concept of colonial determinism.  Colonial determinism attributes current problems solely to historical colonialism, and in the process, it risks absolving post-colonial governments and elites of responsibility for their own actions and policies. It can create a narrative where current struggles are solely the fault of external forces, hindering efforts to address internal issues like corruption, mismanagement, and social inequalities. This can also discourage local initiatives and solutions by fostering a sense of helplessness.  Rebuttal  Good call out on lack of mech with regards to empathy. We need to reinforce our positive case more! You aren’t explaining at all what the purpose or impact of an objective history is going to be; ‘a bigger world view’ is insufficient. Don’t say etc etc in your speech!  On hate crimes and hatred - are we building this out, or just asserting that this is what occurs?  On nationalism - explains how this leads to a certain types of national politics, which is worse and more ethnicity and/or religious based going forward. Who does it empower and why?  Graphic doesn’t really mean visual - it just means in explicit detail. The Prop team doesn’t have to defend traumatising children!  We need to either meet the question of cultural erasure, or challenge whether this is as big of a deal as the other side makes it out to be. Audrey analyses how this affects minorities in particular detail, we brush it off with the average person response; which is good but insufficient.  07:11  Ask trickier POIs! | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Gwyneth Chan |
| --- |

| **Motion**: In post-colonial states, This house believes that education (e.g. history curricula) should graphically and exclusively focus on the negative impact of colonialism. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 70.5 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  I’m unsure still why this is exclusive to your side; why is such a singularly negative view needed for all these benefits?  Rebuttal   * Good on saturation, this gives me a reason as to why it has to be exclusive. Is this what the status quo is like? Opp characterises why the average person isn’t pro colonialism, or an apologist, which means we need to first recharacterise to explain why saturation is even true to begin with. * What is the point or purpose of this knowledge? Is it new, is it different, what is distinct? * Good call out on objectivity.   Clash 1: Accountability   * Will it ever be possible to achieve accountability for these powers? Will they ever apologise, or will we ever get reparations? What is the value of knowledge? What is the impact of knowledge?   Clash 2: Truth   * I buy your side is more true, but why does it matter in the round? We needed to explain what the value of this iteration of truth was going to be. For instance, the type of harms and historical baggage they suffered due to colonial practices, and that they require this external party to be blamed. For example, a lot of racial divisions are a byproduct of divide-and-conquer, so we can use this as a pathway of mending the bridges between different ethnicities.   We needed to argue the following:  Colonial history often marginalised or erased the narratives of the colonised. A graphic focus on the negative impacts—exploitation, oppression, cultural destruction—serves to rectify this injustice by bringing these experiences to the forefront. This can be a powerful tool for fostering a sense of shared identity and collective memory among the formerly colonised.  What is needed by the population moving forward? How do we create a central national identity? Why is this important? Was there a lot of fragmentation and alienation between ethnic communities during colonisation? Consider what the needs of a post-colonial country are!  07:32 | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Adrian Wong |
| --- |

| **Motion**: In post-colonial states, This house believes that education (e.g. history curricula) should graphically and exclusively focus on the negative impact of colonialism. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 71 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Implication of all these call outs needed! I don’t disagree with you, but you need to be **specific** in your call out. For instance, that yes, they have ‘truth’. What is valuable about truth? We still don’t know!  Is it true that the average person living in these countries has super positive views about colonisers? I want you to consider this and think if this is true or not?  Dilution; good on what mech one argument relies on in one part of the case, versus the other. Point this out and then MOVE ON!  You spent too much time on reframing up top; your second observation was great, but the first was under-emphasised; POI response is good; point out how we have all that; what we also have is XYZ. Explain the impact of this general dehumanisation/why this race wide generalisation must occur.  Clash 1:   * Good on proportionate. What is the impact of this, why is this correct? * Good on what the way in which we think about colonialism is, and how unlikely apologism actually is.   Clash 2:   * On nationalism; what is the impact of bad international relationships? We need to impact this out.   On Opp, this is a debate about anger and identity, and the concept of colonial determinism. Colonial determinism attributes current problems solely to historical colonialism, and in the process, it risks absolving post-colonial governments and elites of responsibility for their own actions and policies. It can create a narrative where current struggles are solely the fault of external forces, hindering efforts to address internal issues like corruption, mismanagement, and social inequalities. This can also discourage local initiatives and solutions by fostering a sense of helplessness.  06:42 | | | | | | |